

2016-04-08 Updated TG for Metadata (v2.0rc2) (MIG-T)



Kommentierungszeitraum ist abgelaufen, bitte nicht mehr kommentieren!

[Finale Fassung der Kommentierungstabelle](#) (am 03.05.2016 der EU-KOM übermittelt)

- [Worum geht es?](#)
- [Wer sollte sich an der Kommentierung beteiligen?](#)
- [Relevante Verordnungen und Technical Guidance Dokumente?](#)
- [Kommentierungszeitraum?](#)
- [Zu prüfende Dokumente?](#)
- [Kommentierungstabelle](#)

Worum geht es?

Eine temporäre Arbeitsgruppe der MIG-T hat einen Entwurf für die Fortschreibung des Technical Guidance Dokumentes zu Metadaten erstellt. Der [Entwurf](#) (v2.0rc2) wurde nun der MIG-T zur [Kommentierung](#) vorgelegt. Er beinhaltet Empfehlungen zur Umsetzung der Anforderungen an die Metadatenbereitstellung für INSPIRE-relevante Geodatensätze und -dienste aus der Metadaten-Verordnung (Nr. 1205/2008) und der Interoperabilitäts-Verordnung (Nr. 1089/2010 inkl. Änderungen).

Der Entwurf gliedert sich in die folgenden *requirements classes*:

- Data sets and data set series
 - Baseline metadata for data sets and data set series
 - Interoperability metadata for data sets and data set series
- Spatial Data Services
 - Baseline metadata for Spatial Data Services
 - Metadata for INSPIRE Network Services
 - Metadata for Invocable Spatial Data Services
 - Metadata for Interoperable Spatial Data Services
 - Metadata for Harmonised Spatial Data Services

Nach der Konsultation durch die MIG-T wird das Dokument auf Grundlage der eingegangenen Kommentare überarbeitet und anschließend der MIG-P zur Verabschiedung vorgelegt (voraussichtlich zur Sitzung der MIG-P Ende Juni 2016).

Wer sollte sich an der Kommentierung beteiligen?

Die Konsultation richtet sich insbesondere an Experten, die sich mit der Metadatenerfassung und -bereitstellung beschäftigen.

In Deutschland werden neben den GDI-Kontaktstellen insbesondere der AK Metadaten und der AK Geodienste beteiligt.

Relevante Verordnungen und Technical Guidance Dokumente?

Metadaten

- [Verordnung \(EG\) Nr. 1205/2008 ... hinsichtlich Metadaten](#)

Interoperabilität von Datensätzen und -diensten

- [Verordnung \(EG\) Nr. 1089/2010 ... hinsichtlich der Interoperabilität von Geodatenätzen und -diensten](#)

Kommentierungszeitraum?

Kommentare können **bis zum 02.05.2016** über diese Seite abgegeben werden.

Zu prüfende Dokumente?

- [Technical Guidelines for the implementation of INSPIRE dataset and service metadata based on ISO/TS 19139:2007, v2.0rc2](#)

Kommentierungstabelle

Bitte in der nachfolgenden Tabelle Ihre Kommentare eintragen (möglichst in englischer Sprache).

Bitte die Kommentare klassifizieren (Type of comment) nach

- ge = general
- te = technical
- ed = editorial

Bei Fragen wenden Sie sich bitte an [Daniela Witter](#), [Peter Kochmann](#) oder [Benutzer-c18c5](#).

Chapter/ Section (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment	Comments	Proposed change	Resolution	Kommentiert von (nur zur internen Verwendung)
(all)	(all)	ed	of the ISO 19115	of the ISO 19115; at places where ISO is abstractly mentioned; please align through the whole document		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Acknowledgements	list of members of MIWP-8	ge	list is incomplete	add: James Resid (UK), Ine de Visser (NL), Marc Leobet (FR), Marie Lambois (FR), Eliane Roos (FR), Peter Kochmann (DE)		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Acknowledgements	Contact information	ge	contact person Massimo Craglia seems to be outdated	?		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Foreword	third paragraph	ed	"This new version aims at clarifying and expressed ed technical requirements"	"This new version aims at clarifying and expressing g technical requirements"		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Foreword	fourth paragraph	ed	"... led to some confusion no that is actually ..."	please clarify wording		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Foreword	last paragraph	ed	"The goal has been to only to clarify the existing..."	"The goal has been to only to clarify the existing..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann

Reading guidance and transition period	first sentence	ed	"As the structure of the document structure... "	"As the structure of the document structure... "		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Reading guidance and transition period	first sentence	ed	"the following sections have been to help..."	"the following sections have been <filled in / added ? > to help..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Reading guidance and transition period	list of annexes	ge	Annexes A and D are not mentioned	add bullet points for Annexes A and D		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Reading guidance and transition period	third bullet point	ed	"... and the TG Requirements on sections ..."	please clarify wording		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Reading guidance and transition period	fourth bullet point	ed	"...TG Requirement and Recommendations of contained in the version 1.3..."	"...TG Requirement and Recommendations of contained in the version 1.3..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Reading guidance and transition period	last paragraph	ge	"...a transitional period of 3 years has been defined..."	please add information by whom this period was defined		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Revision history	third bullet point	ed	"...to specify encoding the the Non-empty..."	"...to specify encoding the the Non-empty..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Revision history	ninth bullet point	ed	"The hierachyLevel element required..."	"The <i>hierachyLevel</i> element required..."; we propose to align this font family for ISO element names through the whole document for better readability		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Revision history	20th bullet point	ge	"A new TG Recommendation 3.4 considering using id attributes of the referred MD_DataIdentification elements and URI fragment identifiers for referring to them in the Coupled resource elements has been added."	please clarify that this applies for one of the two alternatives for data service coupling only		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Revision history	42th bullet point	ed	"The TG Requirements 30, 31, 32, 33 and 34 considering the Limitations on public access and the Conditions applying to access and use elements have been revised is TG Requirements C. 16 and C.17 about Limitations on public access..."	please clarify wording		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Revision history	42th bullet point	ge	"Referring to the new INSPIRE code lists for the reason of the Limitations on public access as well as Conditions applying to access and use ("no conditions" or "unknown") is now mandatory using the gmx:Anchor element."	while we support the use of gmx:Anchor elements we'd like to point out that currently this can't be validated with schemas given in section 1.2		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Other references		ge	INSPIRE data specifications are not listed though a lot of information is taken from there (e.g. theme-specific metadata)	add TG DS ...		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Other references		ge	"[TG SDS] Technical Guidance for INSPIRE Spatial Data Services and services allowing spatial data services to be invoked, version 3.1"	deprecatred version 3.1 should no longer be referenced here, please reference version 3.2 instead		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Terms and abbreviations		ed	Names of external documents are not flagged	flag names of external documents through the whole document for a better readability		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Terms and abbreviations	paragraph on Requirements class	ed	"Requirements class is a set is related technical requirements..."	please clarify wording; "is a set of "?		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Verbal forms for expression of provisions	XML examples	ed	"The location of the XML elements within the document structure is given using XPath syntax at to top of the text block in bold font"	"The location of the XML elements within the document structure is given using XPath syntax at to top of the text block in bold font"		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
1.1. Introduction	third paragraph	ed	In the context of metadata for spatial data and Spatial Data Services, the standards [ISO 19115], [ISO 19119], [ISO 19139] and ISO 15836 (Dublin Core) have been identified as important standards.	add paranthesis for ISO 15836		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann

1.1. Introduction	sixth paragraph	ed	"... refers to the abovementioned Regulation ."	"... refers to the abovementioned regulation ."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
1.2. XML Encoding of ISO metadata	first paragraph	ed	"To provide an XML encoding also for the INSPIRE service metadata, XML Schemas implementing the [ISO 19119] model have been published by the OGC"	reference to actual schema is missing; add reference to http://schemas.opengis.net/csw/2.0.2/profiles/apiso/1.0.0/apiso.xsd		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
1.2. XML Encoding of ISO metadata	first paragraph	te	"To provide an XML encoding also for the INSPIRE service metadata, XML Schemas implementing the [ISO 19119] model have been published by the OGC"	add a hint that currently gmx: namespace is not included in the referenced schema and hence e.g. gmx:Anchor elements are not valid		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
1.3. INSPIRE Validator Service	first paragraph	ed	"The validator accepts metadata that follow the Metadata Technical Guidelines encoded in EN ISO 19139 schema."	reference to particular schema is missing		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
1.3. INSPIRE Validator Service	second paragraph in Note	ge	"The validator is a proof of concept that has been developed to test these guidelines. It is not intended to be an operational tool,..."	"The validator is a proof of concept that has been developed to test these guidelines. It is not intended to be an operational tool,..."; this statement refers to the old version of this document		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.1. Metadata structure and encoding	TG Requirement C.1	te	listed schemas do not fulfil some requirements given in this document where gmx:Anchor is mandatory	provide a reference to a schema that includes the gmx: namespace or downgrade to a recommendation		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.3.2. Metadata point of contact	TG Requirement C.5	ed	"The value of gmd:role/gmd:CI_RoleCode shall point to the value "pointOfContact" of ISO 19139 code list CI_RoleCode20."	add paranthesis for ISO 19139		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.4.6. Limitations on public access	first paragraph	ed	"Concerning providing the metadata for the data sets and services though Discovery services..."	"Concerning providing the metadata for the data sets and services through Discovery services..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.4.6. Limitations on public access	sentence following TG Requirement C.16	ed	" The make the references to the allowed..."	" To make the references to the allowed..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.5.1. Conformity	third paragraph	ed	"In this specification the above Implementing Rule text is is interpreted to mean in that the conformity shall..."	rephrase for better understanding		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.5.1. Conformity	list of three bullets	ge	For Network services the IR 1089/2010 has to be cited as well	change wording		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
2.5.1. Conformity	TG Requirements C.21 and C.22	ed	"... with each INSPIRE Implementing Rule, specification document, its Requirements Class or similar part , shall be given..."	clarify "similar part"		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1. Baseline metadata for data sets and data set series	Requirements Class 1	ed	"Metadata record fulfilling all the TG Requirements..."	" A Metadata record fulfilling all the TG Requirements..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1.2. Identification info section	TG Recommendation 1.1	ge	Recommendation is not covering both alternatives for data service coupling and is obsolete for the way still to be added	see E-Mail from Wed, 20 Apr 2016, where addition regarding data service coupling based on our proposal has been promised		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1.2.1. Unique resource identifier	TG Recommendation 1.2	ed	" It's recommended to make..."	" It is recommended to make..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1.2.2. Keywords for Spatial Data Theme(s)	TG Requirement 1.4	ed	"... at least one keyword from the Inspire Spatial Data Themes vocabulary..."	"... at least one keyword from the INSPIRE Spatial Data Themes vocabulary..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann

3.1.2.3. Spatial resolution	Example 1.4 and 1.5	ed	"Spatial resolution of a data sets expressed..."	"Spatial resolution of a data sets expressed..."		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1.2.4. Resource language	sentence following TG Requirement 1.6		"Table 1 contained in Part C of Regulation 1205/2008] defines..."	add paranthesis for 1205/2008		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
3.1.2.4. Resource language	TG Requirement 1.7	ed	more information on multi-lingual encoding would be useful	add a link to section 2.2		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4.1.2.4. Linking to provided data sets using coupled resource	whole section	te/ge	alternative for data service coupling based on URI is missing	see E-Mail from Wed, 20 Apr 2016, where addition regarding data service coupling based on our proposal has been promised		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4.1.2.4. Linking to provided data sets using coupled resource	TG Recommendation 3.5	ge	recommendation is obsolete when documenting the two alternative ways	remove		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4.2.2. Data quality info section	TG Requirement 4.2	ge	For Network services the IR 1089/2010 has to be cited as well	change wording: citing IR 1089/2010 is mandatory		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4.2.2. Data quality info section	Example 4.1	ge	example for citing IR 1089/2010 is missing	maintain example		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4.3.3.1. Conformity to INSPIRE Implementation Rules	question in yellow	ge	1312/2014 is an amendment to 1089/2010. Referring to 1089/2010 is sufficient and includes the SDS issues.	no additional declaration		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.4 Resource locator	ed	Heading to 1.4 is between the tables of Resource locator for "datasets and series" and "services"	Shift heading before first table		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.4 Resource locator	ge	Example for Resource locator for datasets is misleading: a link to a capabilities document of a corresponding service might be allowed, but is more sufficient for services itself	change example to e.g. a link to a web site with further product information		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.5 Unique resource identifier, Example	ed	namespace and identifier seem to be part of MD_Identifier. Have it more clear that this is a semantic distinguishing only, but storing is in element code only. We had this shown in a much clearer way in a former draft (based on v055)	The Unique resource identifier semantically consisting of <u>namespace</u> : https://example.org/ and <u>identifier</u> : ab749859 and is provided together in element code: https://example.org/ab749859		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.5 Unique resource identifier, Comments	ed	link to 2.2.6 is wrong	change link to 4.1.2.4		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.6 Coupled resource	ed	example does not consider both alternatives for data service coupling	add an example using URI for data service coupling according to in 4.1.2.4		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	1.6 Coupled resource, Comments	ed	link to 2.2.5 is wrong	change link to 3.1.2.1		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann

Annex C.2	1.7 Resource language, Comments	ed	reference to A.11 is not suitable; there's no corresponding content in this document	delete comment		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	2.2 Spatial data service type, Domain	ed	link to 1.3.1 is wrong	change link to Annex D.3		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	4.1 Geographic bounding box, Comments	ed	link to SC13 is wrong	remove this sentence due to SCxx being erased		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	8.1 Conditions applying to access and use	ge	there's no example for useConstraints; We had this shown in a much clearer way in a former draft (based on v055)	build up example for useConstraints		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	8.1 Conditions applying to access and use, second table, Domain	ed	there are designated codelist values for these texts	add a link to Annex D.2		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	8.2 Limitations on public access, second table, Domain	ed	there are designated codelist values for the reasons to limit public access	add a link to Annex D.1		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.2	10.3 Metadata language, Comments	ed	reference to A.11 is not suitable; there's no corresponding content in this document	delete comment		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.3	Coordinate Reference System, Domain	ed	The mentioned table isn't listed below! The content is in Annex D.5 now.	add link to Annex D.5		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.7	<all>, Example	ed	There are no XML examples for theme-specific metadata in the document.	add examples or remove statement		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.7	Digital transfer options information, Comments	ed	link to 2.2.4 is wrong	change link to 3.1.3.1		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
Annex C.7	Extent, Domain	ed	link to 2.5.1 is wrong	change link to 2.4.8		Martin Seiler, Peter Kochmann
4. Requirements Classes for Spatial Data Services	(all)	ge	Version 3.2 of [TG SDS] will include requirements concerning Metadata as well. Both documents shall be consistent.	Ensure consistency between [TG SDS], version 3.2 and [TG MD], version 2.0 and consider including metadata requirements in [TG MD] only, i.e. remove metadata requirements from [TG SDS].		Daniela Hogrebe
2.1	TG Requirement	ge	There is a strong need to validate service metadata that uses GML 3.2.1 elements instead of GML 3.2.0 elements (as used in http://schemas.opengis.net/iso/19139/20060504/srv/). We are aware of the GML 3.2.0 / 3.2.1 problem in the metadata application schemas as discussed e.g. in https://github.com/inspire-eu-validation/ats-metadata/issues/95 . We support the suggested solution and highly recommend that JRC should host updated schemas for the SRV namespace and an adopted ISO AP schema.	Provide and host a valid Schema XSD for Service Metadata using GML 3.2.1 (e.g. the ones generated by IGN). Refer to the Schemas in the Requirement A.1		Jan Schulze Althoff
Revision history	15th bullet point	ed	The IR Requirement for providing both the code and and the code space has been interpreted as integrated parts of a single URI character string.	The IR Requirement for providing both the code and and the code space has been interpreted as integrated parts of a single URI character string.		Steffen Bach

Revision history	29th bullet point	ed	TG Recommendation 12 has bee split into TG Recommendations 1.4 (for data sets and data set series) and 3.3 (for Spatial Data Services).	TG Recommendation 12 has been split into TG Recommendations 1.4 (for data sets and dataset series) and 3.3 (for Spatial Data Services).		Steffen Bach
Other references		ed	Technical Guidance for INSPIRE Discovery Services, version 3.1, http://inspire.jrc.ec.europa.eu/documents/Network_Services/TechnicalGuidance_DiscoveryServices_v3.1.pdf	Link is referenced incomplete and shall be fixed.		Steffen Bach
	TG Requirements	ge	The INSPIRE multiplicity shall be described consistently in all Requirements as listed in Annex C: INSPIRE metadata element catalog.	INSPIRE multiplicity shall be added in Requirement where missing.		Steffen Bach
Annex D.1	Code list URI	ed	The URI http://inspire.ec.europa.eu/registry/metadata-codelist/LimitationsOnPublicAccess is unavailable.	If URI is accessible till publication of the document nothing has to be done, if not state shall be described in e.g. footer.		Steffen Bach
Annex D.2	Code list URI	ed	The URI http://inspire.ec.europa.eu/registry/metadata-codelist/ is unavailable.	If URI is accessible till publication of the document nothing has to be done, if not state shall be described in e.g. footer.		Steffen Bach
Annex D.4	Code list URI	ed	The URI http://inspire.ec.europa.eu/registry/metadata-codelist/QualityOfServiceCriteriaCode is unavailable.	If URI is accessible till publication of the document nothing has to be done, if not state shall be described in e.g. footer.		Steffen Bach
all	all	ge	Find an uniform template for all TG documents (e.g. TG requirements, TG recommendation, references, terms etc.)			GDI-LSA
Foreword to this version	paragraph 4: The mapping from the ISO 19115/ 19115 elements ...	ed		The mapping from the ISO 19115/19119 elements ...		GDI-LSA
Reading guidance and transition period	first paragraph, fourth bullet point : ... [TG SDS]	ed	Write all references bold and be therefore uniform with other documents.	... [TG SDS] ...		GDI-LSA
Normative references		ed	Work uniform with other similar documents (see e.g. Draft "Technical Guidance for INSPIRE Spatial Data Services and services allowing spatial data services to be invoked").	e.g. [INSPIRE DIRD Directive] INSPIRE, Implementing Directive 2007/2/EC ... or [Verordnung 1205/2008/EG-INS MD] Verordnung 1205/2008/EC etc.		GDI-LSA